

## ATTACHMENT 2 – Summary of submissions to 77 Park Street, South Melbourne

Supporting submissions	
Submission number	Reasons for support
1	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Former church should be retained on the basis of religious history.</li> </ul>
2, 3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Opposes demolition of the former Church.</li> </ul>
4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Former church forms a part of the history of Port Phillip</li> <li>The former church was blessed by the Archbishop of Melbourne, who is a historically famous leader of the Catholic Church.</li> <li>It is a classical building of its time that should be preserved.</li> <li>It is a part of the history of the Catholic faith in South Melbourne.</li> </ul>
5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Proud to be a neighbour to such a significant building.</li> <li>It is a landmark in the area.</li> <li>The building materials represent the era and are endemic to the area</li> <li>The amendment will protect a piece of valuable history, and preserve the unique feel of the area in Park Street.</li> </ul>
6, 7	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The former church gives the neighbourhood a unique and pleasant character, without it, a beautiful nature strip of the neighbourhood would be lost.</li> </ul>
8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The church is a familiar and welcome landmark in the immediate neighbourhood.</li> <li>Support on the grounds of links to Reverend Mannix who influenced the community.</li> <li>Building is an example of classical religious architecture of its time with stained glass windows and other features that need to be preserved for the future enjoyment of the citizens of Port Phillip.</li> </ul>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The exterior of the building is still in-tact and should form a critical part of the heritage consideration.</li> <li>Exterior is in its original condition and should be protected, not just as a street facing façade.</li> </ul>
10,11, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 19, 21, 22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provides protection for the neighbourhood character, and protects and reinforces tangible and physical reminders of the history of the area.</li> <li>The building has a social and cultural importance within the community.</li> <li>The building is historically significant, and site parallel to the former alignment of Stead Street, which prior to slum clearances by the Housing Commission continued parallel to the western façade of the former church and met a corner with Park Street. This provides a tangible clue to the original street layout in this part of South Melbourne.</li> <li>The proposed heritage controls should seek to protect the following elements of the building: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Four original principal facades and roof, and prohibit new openings in the principal facades and roof;</li> <li>All stained-glass windows;</li> <li>The foundation stone in its current location where it is readable visible to the public.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
12	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Amendment will help maintain the neighbourhood character.</li> <li>The building has historic significance to both the catholic community, and as an intact example of inter-war architecture.</li> <li>The church adds to the character of South Melbourne and it is recognisable as a 90-year old South Melbourne Landmark.</li> </ul>

16, 20	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The church is a part of the local character, a significant landmark and part of what makes living in the area special.</li> <li>• The church has original leadlight windows and roofline and is a significant part of the history of the area – historically and architecturally.</li> </ul>
--------	---

Opposing submissions		
Submission number	Issue	Officer response
22	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Planning Permit Application No.239/2017 sought permission for development of a residential building and childcare centre on 77 Park Street and 282-294 Kings Way, South Melbourne.</li> <li>• The Application is currently before VCAT.</li> <li>• The material exhibited in support of Amendment C151 does not provide sufficient justification for the imposition of permanent heritage controls over the land.</li> <li>• The use of a hastily prepared, eleventh-hour heritage assessment prepared by John Briggs as a primary source of a heritage controls is self-serving, and demonstrates the lack of evidence available to establish a level of significance required to justify the imposition of permanent heritage controls.</li> </ul>	<p>An application to demolish the existing former church on 77 Park Street, South Melbourne, under section 29A of the <i>Building Act</i> 1993 (demolition) triggered Council officers to investigate the heritage significance of the former church on the site. The significance of this place has been established by the John Briggs heritage assessment. The methodology for the assessment accords with the Burra Charter and Heritage Victoria guidelines (which include clear ‘criterion’ for determining significance – HERCON Criteria).</p> <p>A three-stage assessment has been carried out, including:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. During the assessment process for the planning application, a referral to Council’s Urban Design and Heritage Advisor determined that the church building may be of local heritage significance and should be further investigated for inclusion within an individual heritage overlay.</li> <li>2. An independent heritage consultant, John Briggs, was then appointed to prepare a full heritage assessment of the site, to confirm and document the heritage significance of the former church. Preliminary advice from the consultant supported the assessment by Council’s heritage advisor that the site is likely to be of local heritage significance, stating that:                     <p style="margin-left: 40px;">“... The former Church of Our Lady is highly likely to be worthy of local heritage significance as a stand-alone property and should be assessed for inclusion in the Heritage Overlay.”</p> </li> </ol> <p>This preliminary advice was used as evidence to request interim heritage controls for the site as Amendment C150 to the Port Phillip Planning Scheme. Under delegation, the Minister for Planning approved this request, and interim controls were granted for the site on 17 November</p>

		<p>2017 and are due to expire on 31 December 2018.</p> <p>3. Following this, a full heritage assessment and comparative analysis was completed by John Briggs in accordance with Planning Practice Note 1: Applying the Heritage Overlay, and the Burra Charter, concluding that:</p> <p>“The former Roman Church of Our Lady of the Assumption is of local historical, aesthetic and representative significance to the City of Port Phillip”. More specifically, the church is of:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Historic significance (Criterion A) as a demonstration of the growing Catholic congregation during the inter-war period;</li> <li>- Aesthetic significance (Criterion E) as an intact example of an inter-war church in the Romanesque style; and</li> <li>- Representative significance (Criterion D) of the Romanesque style.</li> </ul> <p>Council requested authorisation from the Minister for Planning to exhibit Amendment C151 to the Port Phillip Planning Scheme. Authorisation was granted on 12 December 2018. Exhibition of Amendment C151 occurred from 29 January to 5 March 2018.</p>
--	--	---