

STRATEGY AND POLICY REVIEW COMMITTEE
4 AUGUST 2008

POLICY AND PLANNING

A4	MONUMENTS AND MEMORIALS
LOCATION/ADDRESS:	
RESPONSIBLE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR:	GEOFF OULTON EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND PLANNING
AUTHOR:	RUTH MCLEAN, CURATORIAL TEAM LEADER, AND PENNY MORISON, HERITAGE OFFICER
FILE NO.:	16/02/84
ATTACHMENTS:	1. CONSERVATION REPORT JULY 2. MEMORIALS AND MONUMENTS – WORK AND COST PLAN 2008 - 2011 3. LETTERS OF SUPPORT FROM THE RSL

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 1.1. The City of Port Phillip has responsibility for over 50 structures classified as monuments and memorials. In the most recent valuation in 2007, these monuments were valued at over \$4 million and therefore constitute a considerable financial asset.
- 1.2. Monuments and memorials have a social, historical and aesthetic significance to the local and broader communities. The degree of significance is recognized with the inclusion of seven of these on the Victorian Heritage Register and two on the Australian Heritage Database. Two of the war memorials mark the centre of Anzac and Remembrance Day services attended annually by over 1500 people.
- 1.3. Of these memorials which include 10 war memorials, 28 have been the subjects of a conservation assessment by a specialist heritage conservator, Paul Hunt, in July 2008. A number show signs of deterioration and all need cleaning to remove accumulated grime, staining and graffiti.
- 1.4. This report proposes a new management practice and proposes a resource plan that will adequately conserve and maintain these memorial and monument in a manner consistent with best practice and community expectation.

2. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

- 2.1. Policy and guidelines to describe the process and criteria for the creation and naming of new memorials were approved by Council in 2007 and stipulate that funds for ongoing maintenance need to be identified from the outset.
- 2.2. In September 2007 the Audit Committee requested advice on the maintenance of monuments and memorials in the City.
- 2.3. Memorials take the form of named buildings, monuments, band rotunda, statues, fountains, clock towers, shelters, street furniture, trees and plaques.
- 2.4. This report is concerned with those memorials which have an intrinsic heritage significance and which in common parlance are often referred to as monuments; these are structures venerated for their enduring historic significance and for commemorating a notable person, organisation or event.
- 2.5. Memorials which are named buildings, such as memorial halls and the Port Melbourne band rotunda or plaques applied to trees or street furniture are not the subject of this report.
- 2.6. These monuments are valued by the community as tangible markers commemorating significant people and events associated with the City. The monuments keep alive the intangible memories and knowledge of the City's heritage by providing opportunities to encounter history and heritage as part of everyday experience. They are also valued as significant heritage objects in their own right irrespective of their commemorative function.
- 2.7. Some of these monuments have been standing for over fifty years and are showing obvious signs of deterioration. The level of deterioration varies depending on a combination of age, robustness of materials used, location of the monument and exposure to the elements and vandalism.
- 2.8. Preservation and maintenance work requires a combination of specialist heritage conservation services relating to masonry, ceramics and metalwork, electrical services for lighting components and plumbing services in the case of drinking fountains.
- 2.9. Paul Hunt, an experienced heritage conservator who undertakes similar work for the City of Melbourne, other Councils and organizations around Australia, was engaged to undertake an assessment of the condition of 30 monuments in June and July 2008 (refer to attachment 1). This report outlines the following:
 - the current condition of the monuments
 - the type, and level of treatment required to stabilize, repair and clean the monuments
 - estimates of the cost of the above
 - an indication of the urgency of the work based on the degree of deterioration and fragility of the monument
 - a recommended maintenance regime.

- 2.10. The South African War Memorial in Alfred Square was particularly noted as requiring conservation treatment; this memorial is over 100 years old and its exposed sea-front location and lack of regular maintenance has resulted in significant deterioration. Paul Hunt provided a schedule of work to stabilise the surface materials, repair broken tiles and remove staining from the decorative tiles and to clean the surfaces. He was engaged in June 2008 to undertake the listed works immediately.
- 2.11. Current best practice for the care of heritage objects aims to retain as much of the original materials as is possible by stabilising these and preventing further deterioration. Replication and replacement of components is regarded as an intervention of last resort and to be kept to a minimum. The strategy applies to the large structural elements as well as mortar, adhesives and surfaces.
- 2.12. International standards applicable to the treatment of heritage items are articulated in the following documents:-
- International Council on Monuments and Sites (*ICOMOS*) *Burra Charter, 1999. The Australian ICOMOS charter for the conservation of places of cultural significance,*
 - Australian Institute for the Conservation of Cultural Materials ethical guidelines
 - *Significance National Conservation and Preservation Policy and Strategy.*
- 2.13. Both State and Federal Governments provide funding assistance by way of grants for the purpose of maintaining monuments and memorials. These primarily apply either to war memorials or to objects of state or national significance or located within a local heritage overlay. All of the 30 memorials assessed lie within a heritage overlay.

3. RECOMMENDED OPTION

It is recommended that monuments and memorials are treated as heritage items registered in the Port Philip City Collection through the application of conservation standards for determining the maintenance requirements of these assets.

It is also recommended that Council refer the 3 year Work and Cost Plan (2008 - 2011) to the mid-year budget review process for consideration with a view to incorporation of the direct officers to allocate an annual budget specifically for maintenance and based on advice from the conservator currently reviewing Port Phillip memorials and monuments.

3.1. Criterion for recommendation

The criterion for the recommendation include:

(A) Consistency with international and Australian standards applicable to the treatment of heritage items are articulated in the following documents:-

- International Council on Monuments and Sites (*ICOMOS*) *Burra Charter, 1999, a charter for the conservation of places of cultural significance.*
- Australian Institute for the Conservation of Cultural Materials ethical guidelines

- Heritage Collections Council, 2001, *Significance – a guide to assessing the significance of cultural heritage objects and collections*.

(B) A strategic resource planning and management approach that identifies:

- the current condition of the monuments
- the type, and level of treatment required to stabilize, repair and clean the monuments
- estimates of cost
- the urgency of the work based on the degree of deterioration and fragility of the monument
- a recommended maintenance regime.

(C) Prioritisation based on an assessment across all of following criteria:

- urgency of conservation treatment
- significance of war memorials
- state and national significance as noted by inclusion on Victorian and Australian Heritage Registers
- local significance.

(D) A Demonstrated Public Benefit that ensures the most cost effective approach to stabilizing and repairing now to prevent further deterioration and greater rectification costs in future.

3.2. Sustainability assessment

<p>Social Pillar</p>	<p>Memorials contribute to the beauty and ambience of many public spaces enjoyed by individuals and groups wanting places for reflection, refreshment and reconnecting. Being located in public spaces, they are readily accessible to all.</p> <p>Public assets used for celebrations and commemorations support a sense of community connectedness and belonging. Monuments are important sites for regular, significant, community occasions shared by residents, their families and friends and by many from outside the City who seek to maintain their strong ties with the area.</p> <p>War memorials provide a particular focus on Anzac and Remembrance Day and for other events commemorating service men and women. As such they foster a sense of belonging and support the community to maintain important connections with others who share their heritage and interests.</p> <p>The reinstatement of drinking fountains in some memorials sustains vigorous activities along adjacent walkways, bike paths and parks and so supports healthy lifestyles.</p>
<p>Economic Pillar</p>	<p>Long term cost-savings will be achieved by carrying out the recommended rectifications over the next two years and then implementing an annual maintenance program; these actions will prevent further deterioration and eliminate the need for more costly treatments, or even complete replacement, in the future.</p>
<p>Environmental Pillar</p>	<p>Current best practice for the care of heritage objects is to retain as much of the original materials as is possible and to minimize the need for new materials. Original materials were in some cases sourced from Italy and the costs of sourcing and transporting these components would consume resources unnecessarily. The proposed treatments are intended to minimize any need for replacing materials by stabilising the existing structures and preventing further deterioration.</p> <p>Repair of plumbing and drainage at drinking fountains will stop current water leakages.</p> <p>Maintenance of display lighting will allow installation of energy efficient light globes.</p>

Cultural Pillar	This work will publicly demonstrate Council's recognition of the importance of the monuments to residents for: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• commemorating significant events and people associated with the City of Port Phillip and• keeping alive the memories and knowledge of the heritage of the City of Port Phillip and Victoria. Anzac and Remembrance Day services and other ceremonial events which are attended by well over 1500 people annually highlight the significance of the memorials to the local and extended communities.
-----------------	---

3.3. Policy and legislative implications

Policy and guidelines to describe the process and criteria for the creation and naming of new memorials were approved by Council in 2007 and stipulate that funds for on-going maintenance need to be identified from the outset.

Although not legislative, the *Burra Charter* is an international standard which establishes Council's responsibilities as custodian of significant heritage structures. (A copy of the *Burra Charter* can be found on the ICOMOS website <http://www.icomos.org/australia/> and further information can be found on the Heritage Victoria website, www.heritage.vic.gov.au)

3.4. Risk implications

3.4.1. Allocation of funds for the immediate treatment of the memorials and the implementation of an annual maintenance program would:

- make safe and retain existing original structures and improve appearance
- reduce future maintenance costs by simplifying the on-going maintenance treatments
- eliminate the likelihood of any need for the complete replacement of the monuments (or part thereof) in the future, an intervention which could be a very costly exercise and one likely to generate considerable community angst because of the loss of the City's heritage
- minimize substantially the risk of any structural failure that could impact on public safety;
- counter the recent critical publicity regarding the lack of attention given to the war memorials by publicly demonstrating the Council's commitment to caring for the war memorials.

3.5. Resource implications

The costs for conservation maintenance and some rectification work for memorials and monuments over the next three (3) years are contained in the Work and Cost Plan (refer to attachment 2). For a summary of costs, over the next 3 years estimated at \$233,200, refer to the table below. This amount is for the implementation of all recommended conservation treatments as outlined in the conservation report attached and repair of some electrical and plumbing services. Additional costs for plumbing and electricity are still to be determined.

In addition ongoing annual maintenance is estimated to require \$25,000 per annum.

Year	No. memorials	Total for Conservation treatments and some rectification	Monuments eligible for external grants
2008/9	5	\$86,700	3 eligible
2009/10	12	\$97,800	5 eligible
2010/11	11	\$48,700	None eligible
		\$233,200	

Additional staff time and resources (in addition to established EFT) is estimated at 1 day/week for:

- stakeholder liaison;
- management of contractors undertaking recommended conservation treatments and associated engineering, electrical and plumbing works;
- management and coordination of an annual maintenance program;
- writing grant applications for additional funding for conservation treatments;

This will be considered in the context of existing workforce planning processes within the City of Port Phillip.

4. ALTERNATIVE OPTIONS

- 4.1. The current status of memorials and monuments (as per the independent and expert evaluation undertaken) dictates that retaining the status quo is not presented here as a viable option or good governance for the future maintenance of memorials and monuments in the City.
- 4.2. Alternative options would include some alterations with the work and cost plan (2008 – 2011) in terms of priorities and timing.

5. PARTICIPATION AND ENGAGEMENT

5.1. Internal

- 5.1.1. The people who have been engaged with in relation to this issue are:

- Mayor, Cr Janet Cribbes
- Councillor, Janet Bolitho
- David Islip, Urban Design & Heritage Advisor
- Ian Hicks, Manager, Culture and Recreation
- Ruth McLean, Curatorial Team Leader
- Kathy Dillon, Building and Green Spaces Manager
- Sam Hewett, Manager, Asset Services
- Mark Fusco, Coordinator, Parks and Open Space Services

5.1.2. There is agreement of the internal stakeholders to the recommendation outlined in this report.

5.2. External

5.2.1. The external people and/or organisations who have been engaged with in relation to this issue are:

- Lt-Col Graham Lockwood (retired)
- 11 stakeholders at two meetings held with members of the Victorian, Elwood and St Kilda RSL's, 4/19th Light Horse Regiment and Royal Victoria Regiment Association and residents, on Thursday 3 July and Monday 28 July

Urban History Consultative Committee

5.2.2. The war memorial stakeholders were invited to two meetings chaired by Manager Culture and Recreation (Ian Hicks) at the St Kilda Town Hall on 3rd and 28th July.

5.2.3. The recommendations in this report and the proposed work and cost plan (2008 – 2011) were discussed with external stakeholders at a meeting on 28 July 2008.

6. IMPLEMENTATION

6.1. A new management protocol will be established that recognizes the cultural and heritage value of the memorials and ensures their existence for future generations. The monuments will be treated as irreplaceable assets which need to be preserved for the long term. This is in contrast to the current depreciation and maintenance strategies used which apply standards appropriate for replaceable, non-unique assets.

6.2. An annual maintenance program will be developed which prevents further deterioration and maintains the aesthetic qualities of the memorials by organising and coordinating specialist conservation service providers to undertake conservation treatments and minor repairs.

6.3. Primary responsibility for the management of memorials will be assigned to the Curatorial Services Team which includes staff with specialist knowledge in heritage and collection management. They will work closely with the other Council departments with related responsibilities, including Asset Management and Buildings and Open Spaces.

7. COMMUNICATION

- 7.1. Council wishes to ensure the protection and maintenance of monuments and memorials.
- 7.2. Memorials and monuments are significant civic markers that commemorate the cultural and social heritage of the people and events that have shaped this City and Victoria.
- 7.3. Over the next 3 years Council will spend in excess of \$200,000 ensuring our monuments and memorials, including war memorials, are preserved in recognition of the people they represent and for future generations.

8. RECOMMENDATION

- 8.1. That the Strategy and Policy Review Committee recommend that Council resolve:
 - 8.1.1. That the Council thank Lt Colonel Lockwood (Rtd.), representatives of the Victorian, Elwood and St Kilda RSL's, 4/19th Light Horse Regiment and Royal Victorian Regiment Association, Royal Victoria Regiment Association and residents for their involvement.
 - 8.1.2. That the Council adopt in principle the Memorials and Monuments Work and Cost Plan 2008 – 2011, and refer this to the 2008/09 Mid Year Budget Review.
 - 8.1.3. That the Council, consistent with existing policy and delegations, authorise officers to undertake priority 1 works with any savings identified within the 2008/09 Capital Works budget.
 - 8.1.4. That the Council note that officers will also submit a revised Memorials and Monuments Policy that reflects the proposed changes to principles governing the management of Monuments and Memorials as outlined in this report.