

Attachment 3A - Summary of submissions / responses made to the Review of HO3

Submission:	Officer Response
General (all precincts):	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Ensure numbering across all precincts is consistent.	Request incorporated into final draft.
45 Carter Street, Albert Park – building permit approved for demolition (B/69/1994), site now vacant. Graded as ‘significant’ – regrade to ‘non-contributory’.	Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.
1, 3 & 5 Moubray Street, Albert Park – dwellings graded ‘significant’ but should be re-graded ‘non-contributory’. The dwellings on the site are new townhouses that were approved in 1996 under Permit no. 989/1995	Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.
36 & 38 Mills Street, Albert Park – 36 ‘non-contributory’; 38 ‘significant’. Grading needs to be amended to ‘non-contributory’, as heritage buildings have been replaced with new building.	Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.
283 Danks Street, Middle Park – is ‘contributory’ but forms part of a row with adjoining terraces that are graded ‘significant’. Review grading and amend to ‘significant’ if necessary.	Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.

<p>20 Dow Street, South Melbourne – referenced on pg 6 of the Emerald Hill Residential Precinct, however the dwelling was constructed in 1984. Review and amend as necessary.</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>1A & 1B West Beach Road; 237 Canterbury Road – graded ‘significant’ but developed with townhouses constructed approximately 8-10 years ago. Suggest a ‘non-contributory’ grading.</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>18 Loch Street, St Kilda West - Demolished– currently graded ‘significant’, should be ‘non-contributory’.</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>19 & 23 Lyell Street, South Melbourne - Demolished– currently graded ‘contributory’, should be ‘non-contributory’.</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>21 Lyell Street, South Melbourne – contains 1950’s brick dwelling with remnant of a weatherboard dwelling to the rear. An NOD has been issued for demolition of the dwelling. Review re-grading to ‘non-contributory; once permit/demolition has occurred.</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>357 Bank Street, South Melbourne (also known as 355 Bank Street) – dwelling is graded ‘significant’ but is occupied by a 1950’s era dwelling. Also, the adjacent block to the east is vacant but is also graded ‘significant’. Review grading and amend as appropriate</p>	<p>Request supported. Property included in list of proposed grading changes.</p>
<p>Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Supported by Heritage Advisers</p>	
<p>Review all photos used in the Statements and ensure only the best examples illustrating heritage significance are included</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>

<p>Determine whether it is necessary to include both the original name and current name of buildings (i.e. the Nest Hotel – current name, on Victoria Avenue in Albert Park, was originally known as the Windsor Hotel). If it is determined that only the original name is necessary, ensure it is included with the current address so any reader can easily identify the building (and hence the current name). Ensure one consistent approach across all precincts.</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>
<p>Reference, as appropriate, should be made of the significant bluestone paving in the current HO3 area. As part of the review of Council's MSS and Local Policies in the Planning Scheme, we have identified the need to include strategies around preserving these assets. It would be useful to have this reinforced in the precincts (where relevant).</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>
<p>Further review the information contained in the existing Statement of Significance for HO3 and translate into the precincts where necessary. Clause 6.1.2 of the brief for the project requires a consideration of the Statement for HO3 – what elements from this Statement have been incorporated into the revised precincts? How is the analysis proposed to be incorporated into the final version?</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>
<p>Provide a list of all references that have been used in the development of the Statements.</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>
<p>Review the adequacy of references to modest timber cottages across all precincts.</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>
<p>3-19 Little O-Grady Street, Albert Park – the submission states that these terraces were supposedly built to house workers for the urban dairy known as 'Morris's Dairy', which stood on the north side of Little</p>	<p>Request incorporated into final draft.</p>

<p>O'Grady Street, adjacent to Faussett Lane. They were on a single title until comparatively recently. Although the dairy paddock and buildings have gone, the original brick stable for the dairy is intact and is still located on the north-east corner of Faussett Lane and Little O'Grady Street. It also appears that the cottage at 1A Little O'Grady Street, opposite the stables and adjacent to the cottages, which is similar in style and larger than the cottages, was originally a manager's residence for the dairy. Review and incorporate into Albert Park Residential Precinct as appropriate</p>	
<p>Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Not supported by Heritage Advisers</p>	
<p>Ensure adequate consideration of cultural history across all precincts</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. Cultural history is not pertinent to the overall historical, architectural or aesthetic cohesion of a precinct.</p>
<p>Ensure scheduled heritage places are included on the map for each precinct (i.e. as shown on the St Vincent Place East map).</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. As an incorporated document to the Port Phillip Planning Scheme the inclusion would present an obstacle to ensuring the currency of documents. Any change to scheduled heritage places would require a full amendment process to accurately reflect.</p>

<i>Emerald Hill Residential Precinct</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Change the word 'manifest' to 'manifested'.	Request incorporated into final draft.
345-353 Clarendon Street is a 'non-contributory' building in HO3. Is this grading incorrect, or is reference to the building incorrect?	Request incorporated into final draft.
Clarify that reference to the 'town hall' means the South Melbourne town hall.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 3, Para 2, line 2 – change 'although this was realised' to 'although this was not realised'.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 3, Figure 3 – consider relocating to where it is related to text, and include reference to the main street as Bank Street	Request incorporated into final draft.
Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Supported by Heritage Advisers	
Confirm whether the oldest remaining buildings are actually between Coventry and York Streets, and in particular Coventry Place, and include if necessary. Also verify whether the vintage of this area is illustrated by the lack of laneways between Morris Street and Coventry Place, indicating that it was developed before running water existed.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Verify when Emerald Hill became a city (i.e. whether it was a 'town' in 1872 and became a 'city' in 1883).	Request incorporated into final draft.
Review the need to include reference to speculative building and	Request incorporated into final draft

Housing Commission activity in the area	
Review the need to include the Raglan Street housing commission development.	Request incorporated into final draft
Review the need to include a broader description of the smaller timber buildings west of the former South Melbourne railway station and in the east-west streets to the south of the town hall.	Request incorporated into final draft
Review the need to include reference to rows of single fronted timber cottages.	Request incorporated into final draft
Review the reference to the Heather Street reserve to determine the level of significance, and confirm the date of its creation (i.e. whether it dates back to 1857 or much later).	Request incorporated into final draft

<i>Albert Park Residential Precinct</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Pg 3, Para 1, line 7 – change ‘more hotels appears’ to ‘more hotels appear’	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 3 – confirm the address of the Carmelite priory on Beaconsfield Parade.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 3, Para 1, line 5 – change ‘ <i>Sands & McDougall Directory Street</i> ’ to ‘ <i>Sands & McDougall Street Directory</i> ’.	Typographical error - incorporated into final draft.
Review the use of the word ‘under-represented’ as it applies to inter-war housing. ‘Rare’ may be a better choice.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 6, Para 2, line 8 – change ‘Albert Parl’ to ‘Albert Park’.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Comparative Analysis – review the reference to ‘many pockets of contemporaneous residential development’. Could delete the word ‘many’, given that it is then further stated that these ‘tend to vary considerably in both extent and variety’	Request not incorporated into final draft.
Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Supported by Heritage Advisers	
Consider adding reference to the existence of St Vincent Place (acknowledging that this does not technically form part of the precinct).	Request incorporated into final draft.

Confirm when St Vincent Place was subdivided and when land sales occurred (the St Vincent Place East precinct, Figure 1, shows a subdivision plan of 1857).	Request incorporated into final draft.
Review the use of the words ' <i>...a number of blocks of flats along the more prominent thoroughfares such as Victoria Avenue and Kerferd Road</i> ' and perhaps list the examples.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 4, Description – review the merit in including reference to examples of single fronted cottages in Reed, Page, Danks, Little Page, Ashworth, Smith and Draper Streets (all or some of these streets as relevant).	Request incorporated into final draft.
Clarify whether there were different factors influencing the rate of residential development.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Review the suggestion that the block from Little Page Street to Danks Street, and the south side of Philipson Street around into Page Street, were built by the same developer.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Consider whether it is necessary to incorporate detail of 'speculative' building that occurred in the 1880's, evidenced by the rows of cottages.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Not supported by Heritage Advisers	
Pg 5, figure 7 – is there a better example of double fronted timber villas with intact original fencing?	Request not incorporated into final draft. This example is considered to adequately illustrate this housing type.

Comparative Analysis – review the reference to ‘many pockets of contemporaneous residential development’. Could delete the word ‘many’, given that it is then further stated that these ‘tend to vary considerably in both extent and variety’

Request not incorporated into final draft. It is not incorrect to refer to ‘many’ pockets of similar development.

<i>Albert Park Lake</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Pg 9, Para 3, line 7 – delete the word ‘often’ in ‘These are often of aesthetic or architectural significance...’	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 9, Para 4, line 4 – change ‘in the case of the Grand Prix, at a state or national level’ to ‘in the case of the Grand Prix, at an inter-national level’.	Request incorporated into final draft.

<i>St Vincent Place East</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Need to review use of the word St Vincent’s in this precinct – St Vincent Place is singular.	Request incorporated into final draft.

<i>Bridport Street/Victoria Avenue</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Need to ensure that street names are fully referenced (i.e. '121 Bridport' should be '121 Bridport Street').	Request incorporated into final draft.
Should reference be made to the tramway line and when it was first constructed?	Request incorporated into final draft.
Review whether it is necessary to include both original property numbers and current property numbers. One approach should be adopted for all precincts (suggest that only current property numbers are referenced, as these can be immediately identified by the community).	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 5, Para 3 – would be useful to provide some examples of the interwar buildings that are noted as being 'often of architectural interest in their own right'	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 5, Para 3 – the reference to the doctor's clinic at 1 Victoria Avenue should be preceded with 'former'.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 5 – correct the reference to 'Dundas Street' – should be 'Dundas Place'.	Request incorporated into final draft.

<i>Middle Park and St Kilda West</i>	
Submissions requesting corrections of fact or expression:	
Pg 2, Para 4 – include full name of hotel on the corner of Beaconsfield Parade and Cowderoy Street.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 2, Para 4, line 9 – change ‘Canterbury Road and Kerferd Road both recorded’ to ‘Canterbury Road and Kerferd Road were both recorded’.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Pg 8 – change ‘reflect it key phase’ to ‘reflect its key phase’.	Request incorporated into final draft.
Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Supported by Heritage Advisers	
Pg 8 – under ‘Why is it Significant’, review the need to include greater emphasis on the smaller single fronted cottages that exist as groups and contribute to the significance of the area	Request incorporated into final draft.
Submissions requesting substantive Changes to citations – Not supported by Heritage Advisers	
Review whether it would be useful to include <i>Whitehead</i> and <i>Sands & McDougall</i> maps from the 1860’s and 70’s.	Request not incorporated into final draft. This period of development has been adequately documented from other sources. The existence of these maps will be noted for future reference.

<p>Middle Park Baths are mentioned. Were there also Baths in South Melbourne and Albert Park? Review and include in relevant precinct if necessary.</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. Baths mentioned only in passing, as they no longer exist. Sites are/were located outside the proposed boundaries of the new precincts.</p>
<p>Pg 4, Para 1 – review the reference to ‘several multi-storey towers on Beaconsfield Parade and Canterbury Road’. Might be useful to list the individual towers if there are not many.</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. It is not incorrect to refer to ‘several multi-storey towers’ along those streets. It is considered that there are too many for them to be referred to individually.</p>
<p>Pg 4 – the description needs to be stronger on the significance of the number of Edwardian buildings in the precinct.</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. The significance of Edwardian buildings is considered to be adequately documented.</p>
<p>Pg 6, figure 8 – consider replacing this photo with one that does not have a high front fence (high front fences are not generally supported in heritage areas).</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. The existing image adequately illustrates a typical streetscape.</p>
<p>Pg 8 – clarify the term ‘anomalous’ where it is used to describe late 19th and 20th century residential development.</p>	<p>Request not incorporated into final draft. Use of the term <i>anomalous</i> is appropriate, given that the precinct is overwhelmingly characterised by late nineteenth and early twentieth century housing.</p>